



A Human Rights Approach to Industrialization in the Context of the Sustainable Development Goals

Counsel:

Doc. JUDr. PhDr. Lucia Mokrá, PhD (Comenius University of Bratislava)

Authors:

Brandt, Yannick (Vienna University of Economics);

Nagy, Szabolcs (University of Szeged);

Radu, Anda (Webster University Vienna);

Wiemer, Svenja Katharina (University of Vienna);

Vienna, 14th of December 2015

Content

- 1 Introduction..... 1
- 2 The concept of human rights and their role in developing policy 2
 - 2.1 Right to development..... 2
 - 2.2 Sustainable development and the role of industrial policy in the 2030 Agenda 2
- 3 Industrialization and human rights..... 3
 - 3.1 The role of industrial policy for development in the past decades 3
 - 3.2 UNIDO’s approach to development 4
 - 3.3 Human rights and SDGs 5
- 4 Categories of analysis 6
- 5 Methodology 9
 - 5.1 Research interest and methodology 9
 - 5.2 Project and country selection..... 10
 - 5.3 Selected documents 10
- 6 Case studies and interpretation 11
 - 6.1 Entrepreneurship education 11
 - 6.1.1 Tanzania 12
 - 6.1.2 Nigeria..... 15
 - 6.1.3 Comparing Entrepreneurship Education programs in Tanzania and Nigeria 16
 - 6.2 Trade capacity building 17
 - 6.2.1 Tanzania 17
 - 6.2.2 Nigeria..... 20
 - 6.2.3 Comparison Trade Capacity Building programs in Tanzania and Nigeria 21
- 7 Conclusion 22
- Bibliography..... 24

1 Introduction

There are many different explanations for the persisting gap between so called developing and developed countries and just as many strategies for facilitating the process of catching up. One of the most contradictive aspects in the ongoing debate is the role of economic growth and under what circumstances it can contribute to a positive development and increase in well-being. This question has gained momentum with the increased emphasis on human rights in the development discourse, which underlines the role of economic development as a means to an end instead of a goal by itself.

Industrialization is a well recognized strategy to foster economic growth and the protection and support of domestic "infant industries" an established approach in development theory. The great importance of industrialization is also reflected in institutions such as the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), which concentrates on fostering development through strengthening the industrial sector. However, while the role of industrialization for development was self evident under the receding paradigm of economic growth, the emerging paradigm of human rights questions such a clear relationship.

This paper analyses the impact of industrialization programs on the human rights situation in developing countries. Since UNIDO is one of the most prominent actors in the field of industrialization in developing countries, UNIDO projects are taken as examples and case studies for the analysis. As this research project emerged from the Regional Academy on the United Nations (RAUN), a close cooperation with UNIDO helped to inform and shape the present study.

The first part of this paper introduces the reader to the changes in development theory and the emergence of the human rights approach to development. The following section then briefly explores the role that industrialization and economic development play within the human rights debate. Since human rights are strongly reflected in the new Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), this framework is also introduced in the second part and used throughout the paper as framework for analyzing human rights. Assuming that some human rights are more closely connected to industrialization than others, the third part categorizes human rights (in the form of SDGs) into five groups, three of which are then taken as basis for the following inquiry. After the methodology for the case study analysis is explained in the fourth part, the fifth part then takes a detailed look at four projects in two countries, in order to find evidence of the impact of UNIDO projects on human rights. The conclusion then summarizes the findings and gives a short outlook for further studies.

2 The concept of human rights and their role in developing policy

2.1 Right to development

The idea to consider development as a human right came up first in the 1950s and 1960s, yet the recognition of development as a human right remained a matter of debate for decades. The Declaration of the Right to Development, which stated the right to development as a human right, was eventually adopted by the UN in 1986.

Full implementation of the right to development is a difficult process. First of all, one must be aware of the fact the Declaration of the Right to Development is not a legally binding instrument. It is considered to be a “soft law” which means that the right has been accepted by the international community but in many countries it has not reached the status of national law.¹ Nevertheless, this does not imply the alleviation of the responsibilities of the states or the international community to realize the right to development. Determining the content of this new approach and the nature of the right to development itself is a complex issue. The right to development does not mean the right to everything but rather the gradual improvement of the overall human rights situation within a country and the commitment not to violate some rights in order to strengthen others.

Article 1 of the Declaration can be used as a definition of this right. It contains three principles which Arjun Sengupta describes as follows: “(a) inalienable human right that is called the right to development, (b) there is a particular process of economic, social, cultural and political development, in which all human rights and fundamental freedoms can be fully realized, (c) the right to development is a human right by virtue of which every human person and all peoples are entitled to participate in, contribute to and enjoy that particular process of development.”²

2.2 Sustainable development and the role of industrial policy in the 2030 Agenda

Within the development debate in general and the context of a right to development in particular, sustainability is a major issue today. Following the ongoing debates about globalization, questions arose on whether economic growth can have a reverse effect on the well-being of individuals and in how far it can contribute to deeper inequalities all over the world. Sustainability thus demands a more holistic view on development, taking into account economic as

¹ Felix Kirchmeier, 'The Right To Development - Where Do We Stand?' (2006) <<http://www.fes-globalization.org/publications/FESOccPapers23.pdf>> accessed 25 November 2015.

² Arjun Sengupta, Archana Negi, Moushumi Basu (ed), *Reflections on the Right to Development* (Sage Publications, New Delhi 2005) 67.

well as social and cultural needs while recognizing the necessity to protect the environment in order not to jeopardize the possibilities of future generations.³

The UN 2030 Agenda aims to end poverty by 2030 and to universally promote shared economic prosperity, social development and environmental protection.⁴ It explicitly aims at protecting human rights and "to create conditions for sustainable, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, shared prosperity and decent work for all".⁵ It also has a universal feature by calling low, middle and high-income countries alike for action. The 2030 Agenda aspires to take full advantage of industrialization potentials through the concept of inclusive and sustainable industrial development (ISID). By developing the agricultural sector and creating sustainable food security it helps to end hunger. ISID also promotes equal participation for women in all forms of industrialization and contributes to a comprehensive and powerful industrial development path for the future, making it one of the driving forces to fulfill the Sustainable Development Goals until 2030.

3 Industrialization and human rights

3.1 The role of industrial policy for development in the past decades

Historically, industrialization generated both positive and negative outcomes, as can be seen in the different development experiences in Asian countries compared to the majority of states in Africa. A joint publication of UNCTAD and ILO suggests that the misunderstandings around it are explained "partly because of the wide variety of patterns of state intervention used to accelerate growth and development"⁶. Another point of view is brought up by Robinson that declares that the "difference lies in the objectives and functioning of the institutions implementing the policies and these are determined by the political system"⁷.

In recent years, a new role for industrialization as part of development started to emerge, a transition identified by Desai as a paradigm shift from economic-growth based development

³ International Institute for Sustainable Development, 'What is sustainable development?' (Iisd.org 2015) <<https://www.iisd.org/sd/#one>> accessed 3 December 2015.

⁴ United Nations, 'Consensus Reached on New Sustainable Development Agenda To Be Adopted By World Leaders In September' (2015) <<http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/blog/2015/08/transforming-our-world-document-adoption/>> accessed 3 December 2015.

⁵ United Nations General Assembly Resolution 70/1 (21 October 2015, UN Doc A/Res/70/1) <http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E> accessed 5 December.

⁶ José M. Salazar-Xirinachs, Irmgard Nübler, Richard Kozul-Wright, *Transforming economies: making industrial policy work for growth, jobs and development* (International Labour Organization, Geneva 2014) i.

⁷ James A. Robinson, 'Industrial Policy and Development: A Political Economy Perspective' (2009) (Paper prepared for the 2009 World Bank ABCDE conference in Seoul June 22-24) <http://scholar.harvard.edu/files/jrobinson/files/jr_wb_industry_policy20-20Robinson.pdf?m=1360039164> accessed 07 November 2015.

to social development, based on pillars such as human rights and environmental sustainability.⁸ The publication of UNCTAD and ILO considers the financial crisis as a milestone that opens up the path for more inclusive and sustainable strategies, adding that the discussion among economists and policy-makers nowadays concerns the way that industrialization can be best customized to a country's needs, rather than whether it should exist in the first place.⁹ Along the same lines, a publication of the German Development Institute identifies balanced “economic, social and environmental objectives” as one of the key lessons with respect to the role of industrial policy in low and lower-middle-income countries, among six other conclusions.¹⁰ Apparently, while in the past industrialization used to be an end in itself, the trend now goes towards industrial policy becoming a means to a human-centric developmental end.

3.2 UNIDO's approach to development

One of the organizations active in the field of industrial development is the United Nations Specialized Agency UNIDO – its reasoning rests on the idea that “at all levels of development, industry can be the primary driver in fighting poverty, ensuring food security and preventing social polarization.”¹¹ In order for industry to further cohesive development, UNIDO stresses two guiding principles that industrial policies should be based on. The first is a vision of “shared prosperity for all”, demanding that the wealth created by industrial/economic growth should to a certain degree be distributed among the whole society, without jeopardizing future generations' possibilities. The second pillar is “safeguarding the environment”¹². Both principles are closely linked to the above mentioned inclusive and sustainable development and emphasize UNIDO's holistic understanding of development.

Given the prominent role of UNIDO in the field of industrial development, its strategic documents can give an indication about the evolution of industrial policy in development. There is one underlying concept that can be found from the 1997 Business Plan on the Future Role and Functions of UNIDO¹³ to the 2013 Lima Declaration¹⁴ and that is industrialization as

⁸ Murli Desai, *The Paradigm of International Social Development: Ideologies, Development Systems and Policy Approaches* (1st edition Taylor and Francis, New York 2014) xi.

⁹ See n6.

¹⁰ Tilman Altenburg, *Industrial Policy in Developing Countries: Overview and lessons from seven country cases* (Deutsches Institut für Entwicklungspolitik, Bonn 2011) 1.

¹¹ UNIDO, ‘Introduction to UNIDO 2014: inclusive and sustainable industrial development’ <https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media_upgrade/Who_we_are/Structure/Director-General/DG_UNIDO_FINAL_WEBs.pdf> accessed 07 November 2015 4.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ UNIDO, ‘Business plan on the future role and functions of UNIDO’ (adopted by the Industrial Development Board 27 June 1997 decision IDB.17/Dec.2, endorsed by the General Conference 4 December 1997 resolution GC.7/Res.1).

¹⁴ UNIDO, ‘Lima Declaration: Towards inclusive and sustainable industrial development’ (Lima, endorsed by the General Conference 2 December 2013 resolution GC.15/Res.1).

driver of development. Meanwhile, within UNIDO priorities shifted from "sustainable industrial development"¹⁵ to "poverty alleviation",¹⁶ with the Lima Declaration also placing environmental concerns on the same footing as economic and social issues. Inclusiveness together with sustainability have thus emerged as key elements of industrial development strategies, well in line with the new focus on human rights, as contained in the mid-term and long-term strategic papers¹⁷.

The assessment of UNIDO's perspective on development outlines that the main assumption of industrialization as a generator of development has not changed, but the way to achieve it has become more complex in the quest to take into account new challenges.

3.3 Human rights and SDGs

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Lima Declaration created a new strategic context for industrial development and for UNIDO. The new development objectives cover a wider range of issues compared to the Millennium Development Goals and promote a stronger human rights-based approach within the development activities. Along these lines, the following part will give a brief analysis of the linkages between SDGs, human rights, and industrial development, focusing on SDGs 7,¹⁸ 8,¹⁹ 9²⁰ and 12²¹ which most directly reflect the core mandate of UNIDO.²²

Goal number 7 spells in itself a human right, which is access to energy. Sin-hang Ngai suggests that it is often an implied right, regarded as prerequisite for the fulfillment of other human rights²³ such as the right to the highest attainable standard of health and the right to water. However, the author acknowledges an upward trend of explicit recognition of this right by states.

As the Danish Institute for Human Rights outlines, goal number 8, focused on economic growth and employment, contributes to a large number of internationally recognized human

¹⁵ See n13.

¹⁶ UNIDO, 'Strategic long-term vision statement' (Vienna, endorsed by the General Conference 14 October 2005 GC.11.8/Add.1).

¹⁷ UNIDO, 'Medium-term programme framework, 2004-2007' (Vienna, 24 June 2003 GC.10/5 IDB.27/14); UNIDO 'Medium-term programme framework 2006-2009' (Vienna, 19 September 2005, GC.11/12); see n. 13, 14, 16.

¹⁸ „Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all“.

¹⁹ „Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all“

²⁰ „Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation“

²¹ „Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns“

²² The Danish Institute for Human Rights, 'The human rights guide to the SDGs'

<<http://www.humanrights.dk/human-rights-guide-sdgs>> accessed 07 November 2015.

²³ Jenny Sin-hang Ngai, 'Energy as a human right in armed conflict: a question of universal need, survival and human dignity' (2012) Vol. 37 Issue 2 Brooklyn Journal of International Law 579.

rights, some examples being "the right to equal pay for equal work", the enjoyment of the "benefits of scientific progress and its application"²⁴ and "the rights to work, to free choice of employment, to just and favorable conditions of work, to protection against unemployment".²⁵ It is without a doubt a positive development that SDG 8 attaches importance to the process of "sustained, inclusive and sustainable" economic growth, giving much more space for the realization of human rights as compared to a restrictive perspective on growth.

SDG 9 in regard to industrialization and innovation can be connected to several human rights, such as "the right to freely (...) to share in scientific advancement and its benefits", set forth in art. 27 of UDHR; the right "to enjoy adequate living conditions, particularly in relation to housing, sanitation, electricity and water supply, transport and communications" - art. 14.2 (h) of the Convention on Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). The success and effect of this goal depend to a great extent on the approach towards industrialization and innovation, as explained in section 1.2. High rates of economic growth do not necessarily lead to overall increases in well-being and the distribution of wealth, environmental impacts and other factors play a crucial role.

The targets of the 12th goal concerning production and consumption patterns find a correlation in human rights such as "[a]ll peoples may, for their own ends, freely dispose of their natural wealth and resources without prejudice to any obligations arising out of international economic cooperation, based upon the principle of mutual benefit, and international law. In no case may a people be deprived of its own means of subsistence"²⁶; the right to benefit from measures such as "improve methods of production, conservation and distribution of food", as further detailed in art. 11(2) of ICESCR. It should be acknowledged that the developed and less developed states are equally affected by the challenges of the production and consumption patterns, but their roots and effects differ according to the economic and social context.

4 Categories of analysis

The following part attempts to identify those areas of human rights that industrialization in general and UNIDO's projects in particular have a major indirect impact on. For this purpose it becomes necessary to categorize SDGs beyond the simple differentiation between economic

²⁴ International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (adopted 16 December 1966, entered into force 3 January 1976) United Nations Treaty Series, vol. 993, p. 3.

²⁵ International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (adopted 21 December 1965, entered into force 4 January 1969) UNTS, vol. 660, p. 195.

²⁶ Joint art. 1.2 of ICCPR and ICESCR

and less economic goals employed so far. Des Gasper (2007)²⁷ introduces a useful framework in this regard, assuming that human rights are in fact based on human needs, which allows for the separation of SDGs into the following five categories:

- a) *Basic physical needs* as represented in SDGs 1, 2, 3 and 6. Broadly speaking, the human rights covered in these goals deal with poverty, hunger and health. Poverty, while itself not being a physical deprivation, is one of the major reasons behind malnourishment and illness and is accordingly best situated in this first group.
- b) *Socio-cultural needs*. The SDGs 4, 5, 10 and 11 stand for rights to education, gender equality, equal opportunities and safe, resilient and inclusive cities and human settlements in general.
- c) SDGs 7, 8, 9 and 12 are also of a socio-cultural nature but their shared strong focus on *economic development* sets them apart from the previous group. These economic rights have already been discussed in section 3 on industrialization and human rights and represent UNIDO's main focus.
- d) The fourth category only includes SDG 16 and stands for *political rights*. Justice, peaceful societies as well as inclusive and accountable institutions represent a different dimension than socio-cultural rights since they put a greater emphasis on the sustainability of overall society and political processes.
- e) SDGs 13, 14 and 15 directly address the *environment* and demand its protection. While a sustainable environment and corresponding regulations and benefits affect all people everywhere, these environmental goals cannot be subsumed under any of the above categories and rather represent a transcending category that needs to be considered in conjunction with every other right and respective programs.

The last, 17th SDG touches upon every human right and development effort and yet does not fit into any of the above categories. The here envisioned "global partnership for sustainable development" plays rather a supporting role and is meant to promote global cooperation towards achievement of the SDG project.

By employing systems such as Maslow's famous hierarchy of needs,²⁸ one could try to prioritize one of these categories over the other and to establish a hierarchy of human rights. While such a hierarchy can play an important role for solving situations where rights get into con-

²⁷ D.R. Des Gasper, 'Human Rights, Human Needs, Human Development, Human Security; Relationship Between Four International "Human" Discourses' (2007) 445 ISS Working Paper Series / General Series <<http://hdl.handle.net/1765/18749>> accessed 7 November 2015.

²⁸ Abraham Maslow, 'A Theory Of Human Motivation' (1943) 50 Psychological Review.

flict with each other, it may also endanger the holistic approach to development as envisioned in the sustainable development agenda. This paper uses the needs approach to human development simply in order to develop the above mentioned categories, without establishing priorities among them.

The question at hand is how industrialization affects these categories. The relationship between industrialization and economic development is relatively clear cut and evaluated in a great number of impact assessments and other studies. Accordingly, in the following it will be assumed that industrialization efforts have a positive impact on SDGs 7, 8, 9 or 12. The focus of analysis will be on the rather indirect impact industrialization can have on the other categories of human rights. In order to further narrow down the analysis, this report will not explicitly inspect environmental aspects, also excluding category 5 from the analysis.

Further excluding SDG 17 for its general and mainly international nature leaves basic physical needs, socio-cultural needs and political needs as categories of analysis. To make the study even more comprehensive, only two SDGs or human rights will be analyzed per category, except for political rights, which is only comprised of one SDG. For physical needs the focus will be on poverty reduction (SDG 1) and food security (SDG 2) while socio-cultural aspects will be reduced to education (SDG 4) and gender equality (SDG 5). Together with the promotion of inclusive and sustainable societies (SDG 16) for political needs, this leaves five SDGs to evaluate effects of industrialization against.

The theoretical predictions of the effects of economic growth on human rights vary considerably, depending on which economic school of thinking is consulted. The various mechanisms at work in this context are extensively analyzed and debated in the existing literature and cannot be discussed in the context of this paper.

Ultimately the impact of industrialization and economic growth on both physical needs as well as socio-cultural issues depends to a large extent on the respective political framework and administrative capabilities. In how far economic growth leads to a better life and more equality for all or simply increases the gap between rich and poor depends on many factors, including the political and regulatory situation in the respective countries. From schools in low income districts to measures strengthening women's role in society, governments are the dominant actors in deciding which program to launch, how to implement it and how much money to assign to it. Accordingly, SDG 16 (promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels) has a decisive impact on the effect of industrialization on

other SDGs. Regarding the first point "peaceful societies", Collier and Hoeffler (2002)²⁹ find a robust negative correlation between income per capita and the risk of conflict. The other aspects of SDG 16 can be collectively understood as "good governance" determinants. In theory "richer countries are better able to afford the costs associated with providing a competent government bureaucracy, sound rule of law, and environment in which corruption is not condoned".³⁰ Kaufmann and Kraay (2003) found however, that the empirical effects of higher income on good governance are if anything negative.

These theoretic considerations and first empirical references shall serve as a background for the following part, which aspires to verify the effect of industrialization on the three here developed categories through the intensive analysis of two case studies.

5 Methodology

5.1 Research interest and methodology

The aim of the following empirical part is to reveal the potential effects of industrialization projects on the human rights situation in developing countries. More specifically, the inquiry will focus on UNIDO projects, leading to the research question: "Which role do UNIDO's projects play in enhancing human rights?"

To this end, two countries and two typical UNIDO industrialization projects were selected, with both project types being present in both countries. Although the research takes the form of case studies and thus offers only limited room for generalizations, by comparing industrial development across countries through the lenses of different projects, a certain level of abstraction can still be achieved.

Literature review and documentary research under the umbrella of qualitative content analysis are the main sources of findings for this research project. Criteria for the selection of documents, which will be further analyzed, are various: the kind and origin of document, its external and internal characteristics and validity as well as its primordial function.³¹ The most important factor is in how far the document is helpful in order to answer the research question.

²⁹ Paul Collier and Anke Hoeffler, 'Aid, Policy And Peace: Reducing The Risks Of Civil Conflict' (2002) 13 Defence and Peace Economics <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10242690214335>> accessed 7 November 2015.

³⁰ Daniel Kaufmann and Aart Kraay, 'Governance And Growth: Causality Which Way? - Evidence For The World In Brief' (World Bank 2003) <http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/18033/growthgov_synth.pdf> accessed 7 November 2015.

³¹ IMB - Institut für Medien und Bildungstechnologie, 'Umsetzungshinweise | Qualitative Sozialforschung' (Qsf.e-learning.imb-uni-augsburg.de, 2015) <<http://qsf.e-learning.imb-uni-augsburg.de/node/741>> accessed 10 December 2015.

5.2 Project and country selection

In the theoretical part, the linkages between human rights and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) have been drawn extensively. The SDGs relevant for the further analysis have been clustered under the umbrella terms of basic physical needs (poverty and hunger reduction, goals no. 1 and 2), Socio-cultural needs (enhancing education and gender equality, goals no. 4 and 5), political needs (peaceful and inclusive societies goal no. 16) and economical needs (energy, growth, industrialization and production and consumption pattern; goals no. 7, 8, 9 and 12). The effect of industrial development on the fulfillment of economic needs will not be analyzed in this paper. Rather, as mentioned above, a positive relationship between industrial development and economic needs will be assumed in order to explore the (indirect) effects of industrialization on the remaining categories.

UNIDO employs a number of different types of projects from which Entrepreneurship Education and Trade Capacity Building have been selected as subjects for the case studies, since they are most closely related to the group of economic SDGs and UNIDO's core competencies. For the following country selection process, the UNIDO project list was scanned for two countries that have Entrepreneurship Education and Trade Capacity building projects and which are sufficiently similar for a comparative analysis. With the United Republic of Tanzania and the Federal Republic of Nigeria, two suitable case studies have been found. Both countries are in Africa and reached their independency almost at the same time, which makes comparisons and generalizations more feasible. The countries are also close to each other on the ranking of the Human Development Index (no. 152 and 159) and are both situated at the coast, with their geographical size being also comparable. However, they differ considerably in their Gross National Income (GNI) per capita and population.

5.3 Selected documents

Different kinds of documents from various actors have been chosen, such as reports and evaluations of countries and completed projects, some of them written by UNIDO. Project evaluations were especially valuable for the analysis, due to their extensive and rich content. Nevertheless, it should be noted that any report or paper has been written with a distinctive intention, suggesting thus an interpretational level that makes it important to carefully interpret the results and to be aware of possible institutional biases.

The methodology of document analysis suggested by Lindsay Prior perceives documents as products of their authors with the implicated representations.³² Documents are not simply ba-

³² L. Prior, 'Repositioning Documents In Social Research' (2008) 42 Sociology

sis for information, but within the discourse analysis it is questioned “how document content comes into being”.³³ It is revealed that facts are constructed and that documents have to be looked at through the context of their existence.³⁴ Documents are then conceptualized as non-human actors.³⁵ It has to be kept in mind that the authors of a document have a distinctive intention. Evaluations of projects must be read carefully, knowing that these are not mere facts, but an intended external appearance of the respective organization. Therefore, the methodology used is not of quantitative nature, but a qualitative document analysis which is linked to grounded theory. As proposed by Mayring, interpretation and hermeneutics are the main tools of analysis.³⁶

6 Case studies and interpretation

6.1 Entrepreneurship education

Entrepreneurship training courses are given in order to create and stimulate micro, small and medium enterprises. The support and funding of small businesses aims at different levels and the intended outcomes of such projects include the formation of human resources, strengthening of self-confidence, increased motivation and problem-solving ability, creation of income, improving quality of life, management of the ecosystem and knowledge transfer.³⁷

Moreover, Roßbacher attaches many other dimensions to these outcomes, e.g. the problem-solving ability also enables businessmen and businesswomen to identify new markets independently, which in turn increases income. Thereby it is also closely related to the direct improvement of basic needs, especially poverty and hunger reduction. Increased income and generally increased ability for decision-making also improve access to the health care and education system, resilience and gender equality. Thus, the training courses in entrepreneurship are indirectly linked to human development. Vinod points out, that “a failure in providing human rights is generally due to at least four factors: bad governance, vested interests, cultural factors and poverty”.³⁸ If entrepreneurship programs address these problems, they can contribute towards greater access of human rights.

³³ Ibid 825.

³⁴ Ken Plummer, 'Review: Using Documents In Social Research, By Lindsay Prior' (2004) 33 Contemporary Sociology.

³⁵ L. Prior, 'Repositioning Documents In Social Research' (2008) 42 Sociology, 828 et seq.

³⁶ Philipp Mayring, Einführung In Die Qualitative Sozialforschung (Beltz 2002), 82.

³⁷ Martina Roßbacher, Probleme Und Möglichkeiten Der Kleinstunternehmensförderung Durch International Entwicklungsprogramme. Eine Analyse Zweier UNO-Projekte In Ecuador. (Rudolf Trauner 2001), 306 et seq.

³⁸ Hrishikesh D. Vinod, 'Common Ground In Promotion Of Entrepreneurship And Human Rights' Social Science Research Network < http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=767484> accessed 3 December 2015, 1.

Supporters of entrepreneurship slightly tend to be right-wing, while advocates of human rights show a tendency towards the left side of the political landscape.³⁹ Yet the outcomes might have the power to unite the parties: building businesses as a means to an end can bring development and human rights.

6.1.1 Tanzania

The analysis of entrepreneurship education in Tanzania takes into account two intertwined levels: the micro level of particular projects and the macro dimension of the country.

Starting with the first basic physical need of poverty reduction entrepreneurship education programs providing a well balanced mix of soft and hard skills are more likely to generate short-term improvements. While soft skills, consisting of personal traits and interpersonal skills⁴⁰, such as communication skills, are necessary and play an important role for a person's long term opportunities, they usually need a long time to be truly internalized. Hard-skills, concerning technical aspects like learning to use new agricultural techniques or financial tools can be implemented in a quicker fashion and thus have a more immediate effect on people's short term income opportunities.

According to a study of Elert, Andersson and Wennberg, high-school entrepreneurship education has a positive effect on the short-term probability of starting a firm and the level of entrepreneurial incomes.⁴¹ Apart from the individual design of curricula, entrepreneurship education programs can in general be better leveraged in the long-term if they are complemented by programs and policies that address the remaining challenges, such as “lack of capital to purchase equipment and raw materials”⁴².

Food security can be tackled through entrepreneurial education meant to generate growth of the agricultural and agro industry sectors. That link is assumed based on a joint evaluation realized by the African Development Bank and the International Fund for Agricultural Development that acknowledges the role of agricultural growth in promoting food security and decreasing the level of hunger and malnutrition. Along these lines, a comprehensive study of entrepreneurship education in countries of East Africa, including Tanzania, names among its

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Bernd Schulz, ‘The Importance of Soft Skills: Education beyond academic knowledge’ (2008) 2 NAWA: Journal of Language & Communication 146.

⁴¹ Niklas Elert, Fredrik W. Andersson, Karl Wennberg, ‘The impact of entrepreneurship education in high school on long-term entrepreneurial performance’ (2015) 111 Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization 209.

⁴² UNIDO, ‘Integrated Training Programme for Women Entrepreneurship Development in the Food Processing Sector in Tanzania, Phase II. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (ODG/R.6, 1999).

most important findings the “context specific skills development for entrepreneurs”.⁴³ Therefore, projects such as the “Integrated Programme for Women Entrepreneurship Development in the Food Processing Sector in Tanzania” of UNIDO⁴⁴, develop soft and hard skills that support growth of the agricultural sector.

All forms of entrepreneurship education and training have a direct link to assuring the socio-cultural need of education, even though the exact level of contribution varies on a case-by-case basis. The results of UNIDO’s involvement highlight that incremental transformations of educational patterns had higher chances of success compared to radical changes. In that sense, projects which targeted a small or medium-sized group of the society and addressed only some aspects of entrepreneurship had relatively high rates of success, such as the project “Strengthening of capacities of private sector agencies and NGOs in selected African countries through regional networking and ECDC/TCDC approaches supporting Women and Youth Entrepreneurship Development (WED/YED)”, that was rated by an independent evaluation as one of the most successful regional projects in which Tanzania was involved.⁴⁵ However, the attempt to bring about radical changes in the educational system through the implementation of an “Entrepreneurship Curriculum Program”, encountered several obstacles. Even though the curricula and materials have long been developed, there is still uncertainty whether the Ministry of Education will actually adopt it.⁴⁶

As to how exactly the need of education is assured through entrepreneurship education in general, a moderate view can be taken. Drawing from research on an emergent model for entrepreneurship in Tanzania⁴⁷, we can outline the idea that some concepts of entrepreneurship education are double-edged. This is the case for self-reliance, which can empower students in relation to their families or government. However, reflecting this aspect in the context of individual material wealth, it could also exacerbate inequalities. Closely linked to this aspect is the level of compatibility between the core values of entrepreneurship and those of the local culture. Most of the programs conducted in the field of entrepreneurship education in Tanzania by UNIDO do not seem to take this factor into account or if they do, public documents do

⁴³Erasmus Kaijage, David Wheeler, ‘Supporting Entrepreneurship Education in East Africa. Report for Presentation to Stakeholders’ (2013).

⁴⁴ United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), ‘Integrated Training Programme for Women Entrepreneurship Development in the Food Processing Sector in Tanzania, Phase II. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (ODG/R.6, 1999).

⁴⁵ UNIDO Evaluation Group, ‘Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. United Republic of Tanzania’ (ODG/EVA/10/R.26, Vienna, 2010).

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ Joan Dejaeghere, ‘Education, skills and citizenship: an emergent model for entrepreneurship in Tanzania’ (2013) 49 *Comparative Education* 503.

not reflect it. For instance, the socialist past of Tanzania might represent a significant issue to account for when designing the curricula.

The assessment of entrepreneurship education's contribution to gender equality shows mixed results. A general conclusion of a UNIDO country report in Tanzania states that “gender mainstreaming in the UNIDO project portfolio is visible, but not systematic enough”⁴⁸. The opportunity was missed to include any gender reference in the materials for the proposed entrepreneurship education curriculum. However, support was provided to the Tanzania Women Chamber of Commerce⁴⁹ and projects targeted at women were created.⁵⁰

In most cases, entrepreneurship programs contribute indirectly towards creating a peaceful and inclusive Tanzanian society. For instance, the contribution of a project focused on regional networking for youth and women entrepreneurs⁵¹ becomes apparent when analyzing it through the sociological perspective of Karl Deutsch. He argues that the increase in transaction flows among nations and states at different levels of the societies, including the economy, is an essential element for the creation of a security community, where war among members of the community is not perceived as a means for dispute settlement.⁵² A regional network of entrepreneurs, between as well as within states, could represent one of those layers that contribute to a long-term security community and a less conflict-prone society. Nevertheless, the viability of the assumption requires further testing and research.

In addition, the effect of entrepreneurship education cannot be limited to business and economy but, like all types of education, it is also meant to develop a certain mindset and a set of values. Innovation, initiative, and the ability to spot an opportunity represent the top skills associated with entrepreneurship in a study of East Africa.⁵³ Once internalized by the students, they might be applied to other areas of life, such as taking initiative in the civic sector.

⁴⁸ UNIDO Evaluation Group, ‘Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. United Republic of Tanzania’ (ODG/EVA/10/R.26, Vienna, 2010).

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ UNIDO, ‘Assistance to enhance technical and entrepreneurial skills of business women in textile and related products. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (GM/R.13, 1997).

⁵¹ UNIDO, ‘Strengthening of Capacities of Private Sector Agencies and NGOs in Selected African Countries through Regional Networking and ECDC/TCDC Supporting Women and Youth Entrepreneurs (WED/YED)’ (2008).

⁵² Karl W. Deutsch, Sidney A. Burrell, Robert A. Kann, Maurice Lee, Jr., Martin Lichterman, Raymond E. Lindgren, Francis L. Loewenheim, Richard W. van Wageningen, *Political community and the North Atlantic area: international organization in the light of historical experience* (Princeton University Press, Princeton 1957).

⁵³ Erasmus Kaijage, David Wheeler, ‘Supporting Entrepreneurship Education in East Africa. Report for Presentation to Stakeholders’ (2013).

6.1.2 Nigeria

The culture of the target country plays a crucial role in how to best implement a project, as is shown in the Dutch implementation of a project in a more sensitive issue: “Confrontation is considered counter-productive in Nigeria. It encourages politicization of the issue and fuels the idea that [...] is ‘an issue of Western countries’”.⁵⁴ Hence the project should be adapted to the local culture and regional circumstances. That was the case for the HP-LIFE project, since the “curriculum content is [...] easily adaptable to the local contexts”.⁵⁵

The right to education has been directly addressed in the project. Several training centers have been installed and the cooperation with universities ensures the engagement of even more students. Furthermore, a general rise of the quality and market-orientation of education at the institutions participating in the HP-LIFE project can be assumed due to the inflow of ideas, working material and the equipping of graduates with employment-relevant knowledge.⁵⁶

The equal treatment of both men and women is a sensitive issue in Nigeria. Yet the project was designed gender-sensitively by empowering women through special mentoring.⁵⁷ Hence the project contributes to the human right to gender equity.

The underlying assumption of the project is that young people can escape poverty through being an entrepreneur, yet it has to be kept in mind that the attendance of an entrepreneurship course does not guarantee functioning businesses. According to Banerjee and Duflo, many poor people found businesses, but they rarely generate high earnings and are mostly not managed in a cost-effective manner.⁵⁸ Worth noticing in this context is the training in “finance, management, marketing and IT management” in the HP-LIFE project, which directly tackles the mentioned insufficiencies.⁵⁹

Banerjee and Duflo continue that incentives, prejudices, interests and cultural traditions are often not known to external institutions implementing projects, which is the reason why they recommend pre-tests and control groups to measure effects and efficiency.⁶⁰ In the HP-LIFE

⁵⁴ Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands, ‘IOB Evaluation. Evaluation Of Dutch Support To Human Rights Projects 2008-2011’ (2012), 43.

⁵⁵ UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015, ‘UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015. Facilitating Job Creation Through The Entrepreneurship Training Programme ‘Learning Initiative For Entrepreneurs (HP LIFE)’ And Enterprise Creation.’ (UNIDO 2015), 6.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid 6.

⁵⁸ Abhijit V Banerjee and Esther Duflo, *Poor Economics* (PublicAffairs, New York 2011).

⁵⁹ See n 54, 4.

⁶⁰ See n 57.

project, this has been considered through several batches of project implementation thereby allowing to gain “lessons learned” and to translate them directly into action.⁶¹

On the level of basic needs, the project successfully addresses the issues of poverty, hunger and health through the increased income generation of the new entrepreneurs and newly employed graduates. Socio-cultural needs are predominantly being satisfied: The IT courses are an educational measure and the project contributes to gender equality by offering special consulting services to female students. Since factors that impede the enjoyment of human rights are diminished through entrepreneurship courses, the new opportunities for young people generally help to create a resilient, peaceful society, thereby satisfying political needs.

Through economic improvements, other human rights can be enjoyed although the quality of the newly founded enterprises or rather of the employment remains a crucial factor. In the case of the HP-LIFE project it seems that human rights can be accessed more easily by the target group.

6.1.3 Comparing Entrepreneurship Education programs in Tanzania and Nigeria

Programs and projects in entrepreneurship education in Nigeria and Tanzania generate largely the same types of effects on human rights and needs, as summarized below.

Entrepreneurship education alone does not automatically contribute to poverty reduction, but it is likely to have increased positive effects in two cases. First, a balance between soft and hard skills, such as it was outlined by the projects of UNIDO for both Tanzania (soft skills accompanied by food processing techniques) and Nigeria (soft skills accompanied by marketing training, IT management training etc.), help address equally short-term and long-term concerns. Second, entrepreneurship courses need to be complemented by adequate policies and laws at systemic level to address other vital problems for entrepreneurs and micro, small and medium enterprises. However, contributing to such systemic changes requires projects on a larger scale and is beyond the scope of the educational approach examined here.

It is important to keep in mind that entrepreneurship education programs have an impact on human rights on at least two levels. On the one hand, where entrepreneurship education is successfully translated into business creation, income generation means more money to spend on food, healthcare, further education etc.; a point which is valid in both countries of analysis. On the other hand such programs influence the economic sector the respective training focus-

⁶¹ UNIDO HP Partnership, UNIDO Success Stories. UNIDO HP Partnership To Promote Youth Employment In Nigeria 2015: What’s In It For Youth? (UNIDO 2015) and UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015; UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015. Facilitating Job Creation Through The Entrepreneurship Training Programme 'Learning Initiative For Entrepreneurs (HP LIFE)' And Enterprise Creation. (UNIDO 2015).

es on. This aspect is reflected in the above mentioned hard skills. In the case of Tanzania the agricultural sector gets strengthened while IT-projects as in the Nigerian example support the administrative capacities in the overall economy and especially contribute to the service sector. Taking these links into consideration, it appears sensible to design the technical part of entrepreneurship education programs to support weaker sectors. This way programs can be specifically designed to strengthen human rights in the basic physical or socio-cultural needs category, depending on the respective country's or region's situation.

The assessment of entrepreneurship education thus generates three conclusions. First, it contributes inherently to the enjoyment of the right to education of the respective target groups of the programs. Second, when entrepreneurship education is successfully translated into business creation, more available income means that it is more affordable for parents to either pay education for their children or to allow them to go to secondary school or higher studies, instead of work. Third, entrepreneurship education has spillover effects, which can vary on a spectrum from low to intense and from good to bad, manifested in relation to the stakeholders of the project, or in relation to the local culture.

The potential of entrepreneurship education to be gender sensitive exists, but the implementation manner varies across projects and programs, and not necessarily across countries. There seems to be a positive, but moderate pattern, reflected in the gradual mainstreaming of gender equality and gender related aspects in entrepreneurship education projects by UNIDO. Further academic and policy research can be conducted in order to examine the effects of entrepreneurship education on the attitudes towards women and the perceptions about gender roles in the society.

The contribution of entrepreneurship education to inclusive and sustainable societies is shown through indirect mechanisms, similar conceptually in both Nigeria and Tanzania. However, the effects are difficult to quantify and assess in the short-term

6.2 Trade capacity building

6.2.1 Tanzania

The UNIDO project serving as case study in Tanzania is "Trade Capacity-Building: Enhancing the Capacities of the Tanzanian Quality Infrastructure and TBS/SPS⁶² Compliance Sys-

⁶² Tanzanian Bureau of Standards/Sanitary and Phytosanitary

tems for Trade." It lasted from January 2006 until December 2008 and represented 26 % of UNIDO's total monetary engagement in Tanzania.⁶³

As one of the Least Developed Countries, Tanzania is part to preferential trade schemes, which allow LDCs to export goods to industrial countries without or with very low tariffs and quotas. Such schemes typically allow LDCs to keep their own trade barriers in order to protect domestic businesses and to enable the development of domestic supply and industry in general. Unfortunately, while LDCs are exempt from tariffs and quotas, their products still need to fulfill certain standards in order to enter the markets of industrial countries. Without proof of quality, and sufficient traceability of supply chains, LDCs cannot take advantage of preferential trade agreements and the promising markets in industrialized economies.

Tanzania has so far been unable to "support the private sector to meet international technical, sanitary and phytosanitary standards"⁶⁴ and could accordingly significantly increase exports to industrialized countries if these standards were met. The UNIDO project addressed this problem by attempting to improve the state's capacity (in the form of the Bureau of standards) to control product quality and to accredit other, private actors to serve as certification providers.

The potential direct, macroeconomic impacts of such a project are straightforward. Accredited certificates and traceable supply chains enable Tanzanian producers to export their products to industrialized countries and to take advantage of higher prices there. The rising profits from trade lead to rising GDP per capita and diminishing poverty, contributing to better fulfillment of basic physical needs. Interestingly, as Hafner-Burton (2005) points out, participation in a preferential trade agreement can itself lead to an improvement of the human rights situation in developing countries. She argues that human rights agreements tend to be non-binding and lack enforcement mechanisms. States may agree to honor human rights but still violate them domestically without consequences. Preferential trade agreements, on the other hand, often include conditions with respect to the state of human rights. Industrialized countries can thus exclude LDCs from having preferential access on the grounds of lacking effort to uphold human rights. Hafner-Burton thus concludes that these preferential trade agreements can "influ-

⁶³ UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. United Republic of Tanzania' (ODG/EVA/10/R.26, Vienna, 2010).

<https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Country_Reports/Tanzania.PDF> accessed 13 December 2015.

⁶⁴ UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent Evaluation United Republic Of Tanzania - Trade Capacity-Building: Enhancing The Capacities Of The Tanzanian Quality Infrastructure And TBS/SPS Compliance System For Trade' (United Nations Industrial Development Organization 2009)

<http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Project_reports/09-84413_ebook_URT.PDF> accessed 13 December 2015.

ence some governments to make marginal improvements in certain human rights behaviors; they can enforce the initial stages of compliance that most human rights agreements cannot".⁶⁵

In the case of Tanzania, access to industrialized markets used to be prevented by lacking standards and resulting technical trade barriers. If trade capacity building projects can improve the possibilities for domestic producers to export and make profits, they might create additional pressure on the government to uphold human rights in order to not jeopardize preferential treatment.

The project's impact on food security is also quite apparent. Although quality standards and certificates are introduced to increase exports, they will to a certain degree also have an impact on the quality of food offered domestically. By improving the government's capacities to control compliance with existing norms, unhealthy food products as well as the manipulation of measurements to increase prices can be easier detected and corrected.

For various reasons the 2009 project evaluation found that only 3 out of 6 project objectives were partially accomplished. Interestingly, however, a new element was added to the project. It consisted of awareness raising programs in schools to increase demand for high quality food. By creating additional domestic demand for high quality food, producers in turn search for ways to proof the quality of their goods to consumers. Consequently, the demand for certification infrastructure increases, creating additional pressure on the government to provide respective services. Although the evaluation criticized the execution and small scope of the awareness rising component, it also recommends including such an educational aspect in other projects. From a human rights perspective, awareness rising for food quality is interesting, since it combines basic physical needs (food security) with socio-cultural aspects in the form of education. As suggested in the evaluation, UNIDO "might study experiences learned by other UN-organizations who implement large scale awareness raising projects"⁶⁶ in order to fully take advantage of this approach in future projects.

As for the second indicator of socio-cultural needs, gender equality, the project did not take any specific action to strengthen the role of women. Inclusiveness and sustainability of the Tanzanian society was not a direct target either. However, through the close cooperation with the Tanzanian Bureau of Standards, the project contributed to strengthening the government.

⁶⁵ Emilie M. Hafner-Burton, 'Trading Human Rights: How Preferential Trade Agreements Influence Government Repression' (2005) 59 *International Organization* <<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=325071&fileId=S0020818305050216>> accessed 13 December 2015.

⁶⁶ See n63.

While the evaluation's authors criticize that private actors were not sufficiently included in the project, the support of government agencies can in itself increase stability within a country.

6.2.2 Nigeria

Before 2013 trade capacity building has not been a major focus of UNIDO's interventions in Nigeria. The country was only included in the regional project Competitiveness Support and Harmonization of TBT⁶⁷ and SPS.⁶⁸ However the program faced many difficulties and did not focus explicitly on Nigeria.⁶⁹

Trade has a crucial role in economic development and also contributes to alleviating poverty.⁷⁰ After 1989 there was economic growth in Nigeria but this growth has been attributed mostly to the oil sector while other sectors remain without significant development. Nigeria is ranked 127th out of 133 in the Global Competitiveness Index (GCI).⁷¹ Hindering factors for Nigeria to trade domestically and internationally are the lack of an internationally recognized quality infrastructure in order to ensure safety, integrity and marketability of goods and services.⁷²

The successful implementation of the National Quality Infrastructure program can play a significant role in poverty reduction. "Nigeria's development strategy has identified industrialization, trade and investment as major vehicles to enhance non-oil-related domestic production, to create jobs and to reduce poverty."⁷³ The project aims to strengthen the capacity of trade support institutions, improve the business and investment climate, enhance consumer protection and facilitate domestic and international trade. It will increase the competitiveness and the market value of the goods produced in Nigeria, which enables them to reach international markets while simultaneously reducing demand for imports and thus strengthening the domestic production. Consequently, revenues rise, leading to increased investments and job creation. The NQI program thus contributes to a medium-term poverty reduction.

⁶⁷ Technical Barriers to Trade

⁶⁸ Sanitary and Phyto-Sanitary measures

⁶⁹ UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. Federal Republic Of Nigeria' (ODG/EVA/11/R.53, Vienna, 2012)

<https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Country_Reports/Nigeria_E-Book.pdf> accessed 7 December 2015.

⁷⁰ UNIDO, 'National Quality Infrastructure Project For Nigeria. Building Trust for Trade. Progress Report: Technical and Financial Reports. July 2013 – July 2015' (Project No. 130220, 2015).

⁷¹ World Economic Forum, 'The Global Competitiveness Report 2010-2011' (Switzerland, 2010)

<http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GlobalCompetitivenessReport_2010-11.pdf> accessed 7 December 2015.

⁷² See n69.

⁷³ UNIDO, 'The National Quality Infrastructure Project for Nigeria' (2015)

<http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media_upgrade/What_we_do/Topics/Competitive_and_trade/201401_Brochure_NQIP_Launch-highres.pdf> accessed 8 December 2015.

As described for the case of Tanzania, trade capacity building in the form of the introduction of standards and strengthened compliance control systems can play an important role for the improvement of food security. The effects of such programs can cover many areas, including the quality and the durability of products, price levels and availability on the market. Well functioning and certified laboratories can ensure that Nigerian products are safe and conform to international standards. Strengthening the consumer protection bodies also has an impact on food security. Traceability and clear labeling of expiration dates further increase the quality of products and consumers' trust in them. Generally speaking, food security as demanded by SDG No. 2 can in theory be significantly improved by a well conceived trade capacity building program.

With regard to socio-cultural needs gender equality plays an important role in the NQI program. “The NQIP is implementing activities related to women economic empowerment. For instance [...] an institutional gender policy was drafted in order to capture gender balance objectives, gender mainstreaming training and specific technical and leadership training opportunities for women.”⁷⁴ The project thus ensures that all necessary measures are taken in order for men and women to benefit equally from its outcomes.

The second socio-cultural need, education, is not an immediate target of the NQI program. However, several educational aspects were touched upon in various ways. On the one hand the project gives rise to the need of training of professionals in the new institutions. On the other hand, this type of trade capacity building also affects the educational needs of the society as a whole. The new standards and requirements encourage the producers to learn new skills and they should acquire new knowledge concerning production methods. Furthermore “effective consumer protection requires the knowledge and skills necessary for the implementation of consumer protection legislations, proper education of consumers on their rights and responsibilities, enforcement of quality requirements for products and services and the defense of consumer rights within the provisions of the law.”⁷⁵

6.2.3 Comparison Trade Capacity Building programs in Tanzania and Nigeria

Programs in trade capacity building cause similar effects on the human rights situation in the two analyzed countries however, some differences exist between the outcomes.

Trade capacity building has a noticeable effect on poverty reduction in both cases. The programs aimed to control the quality of products and to increase the competitiveness of goods.

⁷⁴ See n69.

⁷⁵ Ibid.

As an outcome, the opening of new markets and the increasing demand for goods with better quality lead to higher revenues and generate higher profits. The improvement of the business and investment climate can lead to an increase of GDP per capita, increase employment and raise wages. These results will diminish poverty and contribute to the better fulfillment of basic physical needs. Another effect in the case of Tanzania is that preferential trade agreements might have a positive influence on the enactment of human rights.

A significant link between the impact of the projects and food security is conspicuous. In both cases, better quality of food products leads to higher export rates and also invigorates domestic trade. Enhancement of consumer protection bodies and the creation of conditions for higher quality reduce the vulnerability of families by avoiding the consumption of uneatable food. Complying with existing norms and the opening of new markets can help to prevent or remedy price volatilities and the effects of other unexpected shocks.

The educational aspect is not clearly affected by these trade capacity building projects. In Nigeria the program does not include concrete plans and actions for the fulfillment of educational needs in the society. In Tanzania an educational component was added to the program and created new opportunities and broadened the scope of the trade capacity approach. In spite of the modest success of this aspect of the project, the concept of combining trade capacity programs with awareness rising measures seems to be promising, both for the direct effect on production and the human rights situation in the country.

Based on the given analysis, it cannot be clearly concluded that trade capacity building projects have an automatic impact on gender mainstreaming. In the case of Tanzania gender equality does not play an explicit role. Conversely, the NQI program in Nigeria did take the strengthening of gender equality into account. During both the preparation of the project and the implementation there are many positive examples for gender mainstreaming. Gender equality is thus not a direct effect of trade capacity building however, this socio-cultural need can and should be incorporated into future projects.

To sum up, trade capacity building projects can play a significant role in the fulfillment of basic physical needs while the effect on socio-cultural needs is more indirect and varies strongly between countries and projects.

7 Conclusion

The aim of the current paper was to establish a causal relationship between industrial development programs as they are executed by UNIDO and the development of human rights in the

partner countries. Entrepreneurship education and trade capacity building are two typical examples of industrialization programs as conducted by UNIDO and were used as case studies to estimate the possible effects such programs can have on human rights. Examples of both types of projects were analyzed in Nigeria as well as Tanzania in order to gain a certain level of abstraction from country and project specific effects. Nevertheless, the current paper is to be understood as explorative case study and does not aim to achieve the levels of internal and external validity found in controlled experiments and large scale impact evaluations.

The effects of a project on human rights depend to a large degree on the specific program and context. It is hardly surprising that entrepreneurship education which focuses on agricultural production has a greater immediate effect on food security than IT capacity building. However, it is important to keep in mind that when training efforts are concentrated on a specific sector, that sector will be affected over and above empowering effects on individual participants. From an economic as well as a human rights perspective, it is thus recommendable to implement entrepreneurship programs in sectors with low productivity and lacking supply.

Another important aspect that needs to be met for both types of projects to succeed is the active involvement of the state. However, while entrepreneurship programs suffer from laws and institutional practices that hinder the founding of businesses, trade capacity initiatives suffer from unbalanced power relations and contradictive authorities within governments. Integrating private sector actors into the official decision making processes might increase efficiency and simultaneously reduce risks of corruption through increasing control and transparency, thus contributing to good governance in general.

Especially for trade capacity programs there is some evidence that introducing stronger demand side orientated programs might increase the programs' success as well as their impacts on human rights. Awareness building and educational programs in schools about product quality and the impacts of low quality goods on health have multiple effects on the local demand for goods as well as on the level of education and health.

In conclusion, the analysis conducted in this paper suggests that there is a positive link between industrialization and human rights. Depending on the type of project, the effects on human rights vary and tend to affect some of the established categories stronger than others. Although generalizations are difficult in contexts as complex as human rights and development, future research should aim at identifying elements to be integrated into the different project types to increase the possible effect on the human rights situation in the partner country, even if these human rights are not the explicit target of the respective projects.

Bibliography

- Abhijit V Banerjee and Esther Duflo, *Poor Economics* (PublicAffairs, New York 2011).
- Abraham Maslow, 'A Theory Of Human Motivation' (1943) 50 Psychological Review.
- Arjun Sengupta, Archana Negi, Moushumi Basu (ed), *Reflections on the Right to Development* (Sage Publications, New Delhi 2005) 67.
- Bernd Schulz, 'The Importance of Soft Skills: Education beyond academic knowledge' (2008) 2 NAWA: Journal of Language & Communication 146.
- Daniel Kaufmann and Aart Kraay, 'Governance And Growth: Causality Which Way? - Evidence For The World In Brief' (World Bank 2003)
<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/18033/growthgov_synth.pdf> accessed 7 November 2015.
- D.R. Des Gasper, 'Human Rights, Human Needs, Human Development, Human Security; Relationship Between Four International "Human" Discourses' (2007) 445 ISS Working Paper Series / General Series <<http://hdl.handle.net/1765/18749>> accessed 7 November 2015.
- Emilie M. Hafner-Burton, 'Trading Human Rights: How Preferential Trade Agreements Influence Government Repression' (2005) 59 International Organization
<<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=325071&fileId=S0020818305050216>> accessed 13 December 2015.
- Erasmus Kaijage, David Wheeler, 'Supporting Entrepreneurship Education in East Africa. Report for Presentation to Stakeholders' (2013).
- Felix Kirchmeier, 'The Right To Development - Where Do We Stand?' (2006)
<<http://www.fes-globalization.org/publications/FESOccPapers23.pdf>> accessed 25 November 2015.
- Hrishikesh D. Vinod, 'Common Ground In Promotion Of Entrepreneurship And Human Rights' Social Science Research Network <http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=767484> accessed 3 December 2015, 1.
- IMB - Institut für Medien und Bildungstechnologie, 'Umsetzungshinweise | Qualitative Sozialforschung' (Qsf.e-learning.imb-uni-augsburg.de, 2015) <<http://qsf.e-learning.imb-uni-augsburg.de/node/741>> accessed 10 December 2015.
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (adopted 16 December 1966, entered into force 3 January 1976) United Nations Treaty Series, vol. 993, p. 3.
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (adopted 21 December 1965, entered into force 4 January 1969) UNTS, vol. 660, p. 195.
- International Institute for Sustainable Development, 'What is sustainable development?' (iisd.org 2015) <<https://www.iisd.org/sd/#one>> accessed 3 December 2015.

James A. Robinson, 'Industrial Policy and Development: A Political Economy Perspective' (2009) (Paper prepared for the 2009 World Bank ABCDE conference in Seoul June 22-24) <http://scholar.harvard.edu/files/jrobinson/files/jr_wb_industry_policy20-20Robinson.pdf?m=1360039164> accessed 07 November 2015.

Karl W. Deutsch, Sidney A. Burrell, Robert A. Kann, Maurice Lee, Jr., Martin Lichterman, Raymond E. Lindgren, Francis L. Loewenheim, Richard W. van Wagenen, *Political community and the North Atlantic area: international organization in the light of historical experience* (Princeton University Press, Princeton 1957).

Ken Plummer, 'Review: Using Documents In Social Research, By Lindsay Prior' (2004) 33 *Contemporary Sociology*.

L. Prior, 'Repositioning Documents In Social Research' (2008) 42 *Sociology*

Jenny Sin-hang Ngai, 'Energy as a human right in armed conflict: a question of universal need, survival and human dignity' (2012) Vol. 37 Issue 2 *Brooklyn Journal of International Law* 579.

Joan Dejaeghere, 'Education, skills and citizenship: an emergent model for entrepreneurship in Tanzania' (2013) 49 *Comparative Education* 503.

José M. Salazar-Xirinachs, Irmgard Nübler, Richard Kozul-Wright, *Transforming economies: making industrial policy work for growth, jobs and development* (International Labour Organization, Geneva 2014) i.

Martina Roßbacher, *Probleme Und Möglichkeiten Der Kleinstunternehmensförderung Durch International Entwicklungsprogramme. Eine Analyse Zweier UNO-Projekte In Ecuador.* (Rudolf Trauner 2001), 306 et seq.

Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands, 'IOB Evaluation. Evaluation Of Dutch Support To Human Rights Projects 2008-2011' (2012), 43.

Murli Desai, *The Paradigm of International Social Development: Ideologies, Development Systems and Policy Approaches* (1st edition Taylor and Francis, New York 2014) xi.

Niklas Elert, Fredrik W. Andersson, Karl Wennberg, 'The impact of entrepreneurship education in high school on long-term entrepreneurial performance' (2015) 111 *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization* 209.

Paul Collier and Anke Hoeffler, 'Aid, Policy And Peace: Reducing The Risks Of Civil Conflict' (2002) 13 *Defence and Peace Economics* <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10242690214335>> accessed 7 November 2015.

Philipp Mayring, *Einführung In Die Qualitative Sozialforschung* (Beltz 2002), 82.

Tilman Altenburg, *Industrial Policy in Developing Countries: Overview and lessons from seven country cases* (Deutsches Institut für Entwicklungspolitik, Bonn 2011) 1.

The Danish Institute for Human Rights, 'The human rights guide to the SDGs' <<http://www.humanrights.dk/human-rights-guide-sdgs>> accessed 07 November 2015.

United Nations, ‘Consensus Reached on New Sustainable Development Agenda To Be Adopted By World Leaders In September’ (2015)

<<http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/blog/2015/08/transforming-our-world-document-adoption/>> accessed 3 December 2015.

United Nations General Assembly Resolution 70/1 (21 October 2015, UN Doc A/Res/70/1)

<http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E> accessed 5 December.

UNIDO, ‘National Quality Infrastructure Project For Nigeria. Building Trust for Trade. Progress Report: Technical and Financial Reports. July 2013 – July 2015’ (Project No. 130220, 2015).

UNIDO, ‘Medium-term programme framework, 2004-2007’ (Vienna, 24 June 2003 GC.10/5 IDB.27/14); UNIDO ‘Medium-term programme framework 2006-2009’ (Vienna, 19 September 2005, GC.11/12); see n. 13, 14, 16.

UNIDO, ‘Integrated Training Programme for Women Entrepreneurship Development in the Food Processing Sector in Tanzania, Phase II. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (ODG/R.6, 1999).

UNIDO, ‘Assistance to enhance technical and entrepreneurial skills of business women in textile and related products. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (GM/R.13, 1997).

UNIDO, ‘Strengthening of Capacities of Private Sector Agencies and NGOs in Selected African Countries through Regional Networking and ECDC/TCDC Supporting Women and Youth Entrepreneurs (WED/YED)’ (2008).

UNIDO, ‘The National Quality Infrastructure Project for Nigeria’ (2015)

<http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media_upgrade/What_we_do/Topics/Competitive_and_trade/201401_Brochure_NQIP_Launch-highres.pdf> accessed 8 December 2015.

UNIDO, ‘Introduction to UNIDO 2014: inclusive and sustainable industrial development’ <https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media_upgrade/Who_we_are/Structure/Director-General/DG_UNIDO_FINAL_WEBs.pdf> accessed 07 November 2015 4.

UNIDO, ‘Business plan on the future role and functions of UNIDO’ (adopted by the Industrial Development Board 27 June 1997 decision IDB.17/Dec.2, endorsed by the General Conference 4 December 1997 resolution GC.7/Res.1).

UNIDO, ‘Lima Declaration: Towards inclusive and sustainable industrial development’ (Lima, endorsed by the General Conference 2 December 2013 resolution GC.15/Res.1).

UNIDO, ‘Strategic long-term vision statement’ (Vienna, endorsed by the General Conference 14 October 2005 GC.11.8/Add.1).

UNIDO, ‘Integrated Training Programme for Women Entrepreneurship Development in the Food Processing Sector in Tanzania, Phase II. United Republic of Tanzania. Report of the evaluation mission’ (ODG/R.6, 1999)

<https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Country_Reports/Tanzania.PDF> accessed 13 December 2015..

UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. United Republic of Tanzania' (ODG/EVA/10/R.26, Vienna, 2010).

UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent UNIDO Country Evaluation. Federal Republic Of Nigeria' (ODG/EVA/11/R.53, Vienna, 2012)
<https://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Country_Reports/Nigeria_E-Book.pdf> accessed 7 December 2015.

UNIDO Evaluation Group, 'Independent Evaluation United Republic Of Tanzania - Trade Capacity-Building: Enhancing The Capacities Of The Tanzanian Quality Infrastructure And TBS/SPS Compliance System For Trade' (United Nations Industrial Development Organization 2009)
<http://www.unido.org/fileadmin/user_media/About_UNIDO/Evaluation/Project_reports/09-84413_ebook_URT.PDF> accessed 13 December 2015.

UNIDO HP Partnership, UNIDO Success Stories. UNIDO HP Partnership To Promote Youth Employment In Nigeria 2015: What's In It For Youth? (UNIDO 2015)

UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015; UNIDO-HP Partnership 2015. Facilitating Job Creation Through The Entrepreneurship Training Programme 'Learning Initiative For Entrepreneurs (HP LIFE)' And Enterprise Creation. (UNIDO 2015).

World Economic Forum, 'The Global Competitiveness Report 2010-2011' (Switzerland, 2010) <http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GlobalCompetitivenessReport_2010-11.pdf> accessed 7 December 2015.